

E&E Project Evaluation Form

****Please be advised that completed evaluations are made available publicly and are posted on Stewardship Ontario's E&E Fund web site****

Project Name/Number/Priority area: Enhanced Blue Box Recovery Project: Phase 1 /
PN 105A / Communication and Education

Lead Sponsor/competed by/date: MGM Management, McConnell Weaver Communication Management, and Region of Peel/ Phase 1 completion – June 2006; Phase 2 – March 2007

Project Duration: May 2005 to March 2007

Total project value: Phase 1 - \$118,447 (\$59,447 for Technical Research and \$59,000 for
Communication Research)
Phase 2 – \$975,000

E&E funding amount: Phase 1 – \$118,447

E&E Funds actually spent: Phase 1 – \$90,070.34

Section 1 –To be completed by Project Applicant

1) What were the Project Goals and Objectives (as per the E&E Application and/or Contract)?

The overall goal for this project is to increase the recovery of Blue Box materials throughout the GTA area (and potentially province-wide) through a multi-year electronic media focused advertising program.

The objective for Phase 1 in particular was firstly to carry out technical research in the target area (originally defined as the City of Toronto and the Regions of Peel, York and Durham; and later expanded to include the City of Hamilton, and the Regions of Niagara and Halton) to identify available recyclables not currently being collected. The second component of this first phase aimed to gain an understanding of the attitudes and behaviour of single family and multi-family residents toward recycling. The information gleaned from the attitudes and behaviour research and the findings of the technical studies were used to develop a comprehensive, strategic communication plan to encourage increased recovery.

The objective in Phase 2 (which is still underway) is to implement and evaluate (for possible widespread delivery) a communication and promotion campaign in a pilot market area.

2) Were the goals and objectives met? (and if not why not?)

Yes – Four technical research studies were completed:

- 1) Aluminum Mass Balance Report
- 2) MRF Residue Protocol (method of sampling residues at MRFs)
- 3) Recyclables Available in Public Space and Schools; and
- 4) Segmentation Analysis (study of available recyclables in Golden Horseshoe municipalities).

The Segmentation Analysis brought together the available information from waste composition audits, Public Space audits study, the Aluminum Mass Balance, data relating to MRF residue and information related to school recyclable tonnage estimates. An estimate of the total available tonnages of recyclables unrecovered in the Golden Horseshoe municipalities was made. A Technical Advisory Committee was established for this project with representation from interested GTA area municipalities.

Four communications reports were also prepared:

- 1) Quantitative Research (telephone survey)
- 2) Qualitative Research (focus group research)
- 3) Communication Research Summary report; and
- 4) Strategic Communications Plan

The strategic communication plan was developed and approved by a Communication Advisory Committee (CAC) that was established for this project. The CAC comprises communication representatives from the partner municipalities. The project is now proceeding through Phase 2, which involves selecting an advertising agency, developing creative concepts that will lead to a preferred concept for electronic and print advertising, and testing these in focus groups in and outside the GTA. The final step in Phase 2 will be to field test the creative/advertising campaign.

3) Summary of Project Accomplishments (*i.e. what did the project do/achieve?*):

The technical research determined that an estimated 229,000 tonnes of recyclables (114,000 tonnes from Single Family Households and 115,000 tonnes from Multi-Family Households) remain unrecovered in the target area.

The communication plan has clearly described a need for the communication and promotion campaign, and has identified the primary target audience as women between the ages of 25 and 60 years. As Phase 2 moves forward, the creative testing process is showing definite strengths. Moreover, several municipalities, including those in the GTA, have been approached concerning using the creative being developed in this project in their newspaper space allocations under the CNA/OCNA “in-kind” advertising space program under the Blue Box Program Plan.

4) Summary of Project Limitations (*e.g. is there anything that should have been done differently?*)

Regarding the Technical Research, data on all possible sources of aluminum scrap (Technical Study # 1) was not available. This limited the ability to fully account for all aluminum recyclables in the Province. Furthermore, limited waste composition audit data (11 studies used) required that the consultant estimate available recyclables in non-audited target municipalities.

5) What do you consider to have been the key “lessons learned” from this project? Does your project/activity represent a “best practice”?

Availability of data continues to be a challenge in waste management and recycling planning. Stewardship Ontario’s waste composition audits program is progressively filling this data gap.

6) What specifically are municipal staff doing with the experiences and data from this project? Do you have plans to apply these lessons in your program? Please explain how.

Municipalities in the target area now have a study that estimates the availability of unrecovered recyclables in both single-family and multi-family households. They can work towards greater recovery if they so choose.

A number of municipalities in the GTA have agreed to consider using the print creative in their CNA allocation of advertising space, pending approval of the ads and content.

7) Has your municipal council been informed about the project and its results?

Each municipality in the target area was asked to review their respective section pertaining to estimates of remaining available recyclables.

8) Do you think there are opportunities to share/replicate the successful elements of this project with other Ontario programs? If yes, how and where?

The creative concepts are being tested in municipalities both in and outside the target area. Similarly, the recycling commercials that may be placed in the Golden Horseshoe media will be seen broadly throughout Ontario because of the way television networks are picked up on cable and satellite broadcasting.

9) Did this project result in either reduced costs per tonne of Blue Box waste recycled and/or increased Blue Box tonnes diverted? (Please explain)

It is anticipated that this project will lead to increased Blue Box tonnes diverted (at a comparatively low cost because the collection and processing infrastructure are already in place for the most part in the GTA).

Section 2 –To be completed by Stewardship Ontario (and reviewed by applicant)

10) Did this project do what it set out to do? If not, what were the reasons/ barriers?

The overall goal for this project is to increase the recovery of Blue Box materials throughout the GTA area (and potentially province-wide) through a multi-year electronic media focused advertising program.

The objective for Phase 1 in particular was firstly to carry out technical research in the target area (originally defined as the City of Toronto and the Regions of Peel, York and Durham; and later expanded to include the City of Hamilton, and the Regions of Niagara and Halton) to identify available recyclables not currently being collected.

Specifically, the Technical Research component included the following four studies:

Study 1 – Ontario-Wide Mass Balance (UBC & ONP commercial & municipal)

Study 2 – GTA Segmentation Analysis

Study 3 – MRF Residue Analysis (Study will examine 1 MRF in each of York, Durham, Peel and City of Toronto. Examine current practices and determine % recyclables in residue, commenting upon optimizing. Baseline for future studies.)

Study 4 – GTA Public Space Opportunity Analysis (In co-operations with GTA municipalities examine trash bins on street, parks, community centres, arenas, public facilities (buildings) to determine uncaptured recyclables to assess potential recovery)

The second component of this first phase aimed to gain an understanding of the attitudes and behaviour of single family and multi-family residents toward recycling.

Specifically, this second component included the following three deliverables:

Qualitative Communications Research (Focus Groups) – 3 sets of Focus Groups X 2 sessions in each location (Toronto, York and Durham)

Quantitative Benchmark Survey (800 interviews) – client meetings, questionnaire design and pre-test, sample design, questionnaire programming, interviewing, computer specifications and extensive cross-tabulations, data analysis, detailed report and a professionally designed version with a client presentation component.

Qualitative and Quantitative Summary Report

The information gleaned from the attitudes and behaviour research and the findings of the technical studies were used to develop a comprehensive, strategic communication plan to encourage increased recovery.

Although the project successfully completed all the research components outlined above, some readjustment were necessary. Technical Study 1 (Ontario-Wide Mass Balance) was originally focused on UBC & ONP, but it was decided to proceed with UBC only. Furthermore, as mentioned by the project proponent in question 4, data on all possible sources of aluminum scrap was not available. This limited the ability to fully account for all aluminum recyclables in the Province. Finally, the objective of *Study 3* – MRF Residue Analysis was modified to develop a protocol for sampling MRF residue rather than carrying out actual audits in targeted MRFs.

11) What are the key learnings from this project? Are there any next steps? What is being done to share the results?

The technical research determined that approximately 114,000 tonnes of recyclables remain in SF HH's in the target area. Multi-family households appear to be the most likely segment where large tonnages of untapped recyclables remain – in 2004, MF HH's recycled 69,000 tonnes of material, or about 16% of the total recyclables diverted in the target municipalities. This segment has approximately 115,000 tonnes of recyclable materials yet unrecovered.

The technical research further found that Schools, MRF Residues and Public Spaces may represent another 14,000 tonnes of available unrecovered materials (< 6% of what is available from MF & SF HH).

The key findings from the Communication Research are that women have a stronger propensity to recycle, and that television and print are the best mediums to reach them. Many people are recycling in a vacuum of information about diversion goals and accomplishments, yet these are considered to be important motivational and reinforcing factors. Finally, people are fascinated to learn about the new products that are made from recyclable packaging and printed papers.

As part of Phase 2 of this project, an advertising agency has been selected through a competitive process. Creative concepts are being developed in the GTA and in municipalities in other regions of Ontario (southwest, eastern and northern). This will be followed by field testing the campaign (TV and print) in a representative Ontario community.

11) Was the project good value for the money (e.g. were there measureable program or system cost reduction benefits, cost effective tonnage increases, etc?)

It is anticipated that this project will lead to increased Blue Box tonnes diverted (at a comparatively low cost because the collection and processing infrastructure are already in place for the most part in the GTA), but it is premature to quantify this increase at present. The pre-cut is targeting the recovery of at least 25,000 tonnes of new blue box materials in the areas where the ads will run.

12) Does this project represent “best practices”? If yes, explain.

This project used technical, qualitative and quantitative research in order to identify the “best” sources of new blue box material in the Golden Horseshoe area, then tested creative concepts that will lead more of the target audience to recycle more materials more of the time. The field test campaign will be measured for its impact before recommendations are made regarding further advertising in the future.

As such, this is intended to be a “best practice” comprehensive blue box communication and education initiative.